



**Human Rights Commission
Regular Meeting
April 18, 2024
Hybrid Meeting
City Space, 100 5th Street NE, Charlottesville, VA 22902
6:30pm**

Agenda Packet Attachments

1. Agenda
2. Martha's Rules (for reference)
3. HRC Annual Work Plan (for reference)
4. DRAFT 02-15-2024 HRC Regular Meeting Minutes
5. DRAFT 03-09-2024 HRC Annual Meeting Minutes
6. OHR Monthly Staff Report

Attachment 1



**Human Rights Commission
AGENDA
Regular Meeting
Thursday, April 18, 2024
Hybrid Meeting
City Space, 100 5th Street NE, Charlottesville, VA 22902
6:30pm**

Please take Notice that this hybrid meeting of the Human Rights Commission is for the purposes of planning, developing, and drafting management and administration documents for the Human Rights Commission. This hybrid meeting will be a limited public forum to discuss the agenda items presented below and to ensure the continuity of services provided by the Commission. The Commission Chair may limit public comments or discussion points that are unrelated to agenda items or that pertain to topics outside the scope of this Agenda. This will be a hybrid meeting open to the public, and registration information for remote participation is available at www.charlottesville.gov/zoom.

The Commission welcomes comments and questions and commits to listening carefully and thoughtfully to what is presented. A maximum of sixteen public comment time slots are allotted per meeting. Each speaker will have three minutes to speak. The Commission requests that members of the public refrain from engaging in personal attacks against Commissioners and staff members and asks that comments and questions focus on matters related to human rights within the City.

1. WELCOME

- a. CALL TO ORDER
- b. ROLL CALL
- c. MISSION (recited by all): *Act as a strong advocate to justice and equal opportunity by providing citywide leadership and guidance in the area of civil rights.*
- d. Notice: For members of the public participating virtually, if you experience technical difficulties, you may call 434-970-3115, and a staff person will assist you.

2. MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

- a. PUBLIC COMMENT (Webinar attendees use the "raise hand" function, phone attendees use *9)
- b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

3. MINUTES

- a. 02-15-2024 HRC Regular Meeting Minutes
- b. 03-09-2024 HRC Annual Meeting Minutes

4. BUSINESS MATTERS

- a. CHAIR UPDATE
- b. OHR STAFF REPORT

5. WORK SESSION

- a. COIA/FOIA/VPRA PRESENTATION
- b. PLANNING FOR HOMELESSNESS EXPERT PANEL
- c. ANNUAL WORKPLAN CHECK IN
- d. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT WORK SESSION ON 05-02-2024
- e. NEW BUSINESS

6. MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

- a. PUBLIC COMMENT (Webinar attendees use the "raise hand" function, phone attendees use *9)
- b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

7. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

8. NEXT STEPS & ADJOURN

*** ACTION NEEDED**

Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in the public meeting may call the ADA Coordinator at (434) 987-1267 or submit a request via email to ada@charlottesville.gov. The City of Charlottesville requests that you provide a 48-hour notice so that proper arrangements may be made.

Attachment 2

Martha's Rules of Order
As adopted by the HRC on February 20, 2020

1. The proposal is presented. Clarifying questions are taken.
 - a. Proposal should always be in writing.
2. Friendly amendments are offered. Discussion is allowed only on the amendments.
 - a. Amendments should be prepared in advance when possible.
3. Speakers in favor of the proposal present their views.
 - a. This is not a time for debate.
 - b. Time limits should be set and enforced.
4. Speakers in opposition to the proposal present their views.
 - a. This is not a time for debate.
 - b. Time limits should be set and enforced.
5. General discussion and/or debate OR small group discussion time on the proposal is allowed.
 - a. Time limit on discussion is set by the group.
 - b. Facilitator helps group identify key issues.
 - c. Motion to table or refer is in order and requires $\frac{3}{4}$ vote.
6. First vote is taken.
 - a. People vote
 - i. In favor of the proposal, or
 - ii. Can live with the proposal, or
 - iii. Opposed to the proposal.
 - b. If a majority of those present votes "in favor" or "can live with," proceed to Step 8.
 - c. If less than a majority of those present votes "in favor" or "can live with," proposal dies.
7. Those voting in opposition are allowed to state their objections and concerns.
 - a. No discussion is allowed, only clarifying questions.
8. The second vote is taken as in Step 6.
 - a. It takes a majority of those present to override objections and pass the proposal.

Attachment 3

**Human Rights Commission
Annual Focus Areas, Goals, & Work Plan
March 2024 – February 2025**

Primary Focus Area(s):

1. Housing
 - a. Homelessness
 - i. City policies
 1. Shelter
 2. Wraparound services
 - ii. Expert panel and fact gathering to determine current trends
 - b. Systemic Barriers
 - i. Restrictive housing access policies based on criminal records
 - ii. Excessive rental costs
 - iii. Excessive application fees
 - iv. Source of funds
 1. Rents for market rate units above HUD voucher payment standards
 2. Rental properties in states of disrepair that can't pass HUD voucher inspections

Secondary Focus Area(s):

1. Legislative recommendation
 - a. Removing voter exclusion from state constitution
 - b. Rental application fees
 - c. Rental registry
 - d. Proactive rental inspections
 - e. Legal representation for people facing eviction
 - f. Anything housing related the emerges from primary focus areas
 - g. Amplifying local food justice initiatives
2. Ally/Safe Space training program development
3. Reparations
 - a. Public discussion to determine public interest and priorities of impacted communities

Annual Goals and Ordinance Alignment

Consider developing goals that align with the primary and secondary focus areas, where applicable.

Goals	Human Rights Ordinance Alignment
Adopt an amended draft of the Charlottesville Human Rights Ordinance for presentation to City Council by June 2024.	• Sec. 2-433. (a) Individual Assistance • Sec. 2-433. (d) Federal Workshares • Sec. 2-433. (f) Commission Policies • Sec. 2-439.1. Enforcement Authority

Complete public hearing training following the adoption of the revised Charlottesville Human Rights Ordinance.	• Sec. 2-433. (a) Individual Assistance • Sec. 2-433. (d) Federal Workshares • Sec. 2-433. (f) Commission Policies • Sec. 2-439.1. Enforcement Authority
Plan and hold a public panel with experts in housing to focus on homelessness (shelter and wraparound services) and barriers to entering stable housing during the June 6, 2024 HRC Work Session.	• Sec. 2-433. (b) Awareness and Guidance • Sec. 2-433. (d) Federal Workshares • Sec. 2-434. Community dialogue and engagement
Submit policy recommendations to City Council pertaining to housing issues by October. <i>Note: budget-related recommendations should be made by October 2024 for fiscal year 2026.</i>	• Sec. 2-433. (c) City Policies • Sec. 2-435. Systemic Issues
Submit a letter with legislative recommendations focused on (focus area) to City Council by (date).	• Sec. 2-433. (e) Legislative Program

March 2023 – February 2024 HRC Work Plan

Actions should support the goals identified above.

Month	Actions
March	• Annual Meeting (3/9)
April	• Work Session (4/4: Carver Rec.) ◦ Finalize 2024 Annual Goals and Work Plan • Regular Meeting (4/18: City Space) ◦ Training: FOIA/COIA/VPRA ◦ Expert panel planning discussion • Actions Between Meetings ◦ June expert panel outreach (OHR staff to work with Chair and Vice Chair to identify panelists) ◦ Prepare draft ordinance for review
May	• Work Session (5/2: City Space) ◦ Review proposed ordinance amendments • Regular Meeting (5/16: City Space) ◦ (Open) • Actions Between Meetings ◦ Finalize June expert panelist list ◦ Outreach for July Legislative agenda expert panel ◦ Commissioners talk to individuals in the community regarding work done on reparations ◦ OHR staff will collaborate with partners to develop Ally/Safe Space training ◦ Chair and OHR staff prepare to present CY2023 annual report to Council
June	• Work Session (6/6: Carver Rec.) ◦ Expert Panel: Housing, homelessness, and wraparound services. • Regular Meeting (6/20: City Space) ◦ Proposed: Adopt ordinance amendments ◦ HRC Research Presentation (Ginny Helmandollar) • Actions Between Meetings ◦ June 3: Present CY2023 Annual Report to Council (Chair and Director) ◦ Tentative: VAHR Conference

Month	Actions
July	• Work Session (CANCELED) ◦ (Note: the first Thursday in July is July 4th) • Regular Meeting (7/18: City Space) ◦ Expert Panel: Focus Area Legislative Priorities • Actions Between Meetings ◦ Proposed: Present Ordinance Revisions to Council ◦ OHR staff finalize training opportunities for HRC public hearings
August	• Work Session (8/1: City Space) ◦ Draft legislative recommendations • Regular Meeting (8/15: City Space) ◦ Proposed: Adopt legislative recommendations ◦ Revisit HRC annual calendar • Actions Between Meetings ◦ Proposed: Present Legislative Recommendations to Council
September	• Work Session (9/5: City Space) ◦ Tentative: Public Hearing training • Regular Meeting (9/19: City Space) ◦ Discuss focus area City policy recommendations based on earlier panels and research • Actions Between Meetings ◦ Amend HRC Rules & Procedures regarding elections and language around annual meetings
October	• Work Session (10/3: City Space) • Regular Meeting (10/17: May need to relocate to Carver Rec for City Council budget session) ◦ Form Officer Nomination Committee ◦ Finalize policy recommendations for submission to City Council • Actions Between Meetings ◦ Submit additional recommendations to Council ◦ Nominating Committee begins nomination process
November	• Work Session (11/7: City Space) • Regular Meeting (11/21: City Space) ◦ Amend Rules & Procedures to reflect new election timeframe • Actions Between Meetings
December	• Work Session (12/5: City Space) • Regular Meeting (12/19: City Space) ◦ Officer Nominations • Actions Between Meetings
January	• Work Session (1/2: City Space) • Regular Meeting (1/16: City Space) • Actions Between Meetings
February	• Work Session (2/6: May need to relocate to Carver Rec for City Council budget session) • Regular Meeting (2/20: City Space) • Actions Between Meetings

Attachment 4



**Human Rights Commission
Meeting Minutes
Regular Meeting
February 15, 2024
City Space, 100 5th Street NE, Charlottesville, VA 22902
6:30 pm**

Click [HERE](#) to access rebroadcasts of past Human Rights Commission meetings on YouTube.

Click [HERE](#) to access an archive of past Human Rights Commission work on the City website.

1. WELCOME

- a. CALL TO ORDER
 - i. Chair, Ernest Chambers called the meeting to order at 6:34 pm
- b. ROLL CALL
 - i. Ernest Chambers
 - ii. Wolfgang Keppley
 - iii. Jeanette Abi-Nader
 - iv. Mary Bauer
 - v. Angela Estes
 - vi. Kathryn Laughon
 - vii. Suzanne Lynn
 - viii. Andrew Orban
- c. MISSION (recited by all): *Act as a strong advocate to justice and equal opportunity by providing citywide leadership and guidance in the area of civil rights.*

2. MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

- a. Public comment
 - i. None
- b. Commission response to matters by the public
 - i. None

3. MINUTES

- a. Review of Regular Meeting minutes from 01/18/2023
 - i. Vote
 - 1. In favor: 6
 - 2. Opposed: 0
 - 3. Abstained: 2
 - ii. Motion to approve minutes passes

4. BUSINESS MATTERS

- a. Chair update
 - i. Recognizes Andy and Jeanette for their years of work and dedication on the Commission
 - ii. Angela introduces herself and her background
 - iii. Chair and Vice Chair have been working with staff on the annual meeting; schedule information has been sent out
 - iv. Many meetings, etc. take place online; urges Commissioners to do what

they can to keep themselves informed

- b. OHR staff report
 - i. Outreach Specialist
 - 1. Just released the public-facing focus area survey; **asks Commissioners to share it with their networks**
 - a. Will close 3/4 at noon
 - 2. Still doing one-on-one meetings
 - 3. Events are in agenda packet, and will continue to email as they occur; outreach data is up to date
 - ii. Director
 - 1. Recognizes staff doing the EEOC's 32-hour Investigator training, meaning all staff can help each other on individual complaint work
 - a. Staff will also be attending the EEOC's New Intake Counselor training
 - 2. Close to another meeting with HUD and the City Attorney; goal is to present it to Council sometime this year
 - 3. Annual Report is basically completed; will have it in presentation form at the annual meeting
 - 4. Recognizes Andy and Jeanette for their service to the Commission
- c. Discussion of 03/07/24 work session and 03/21/24 regular meeting
 - i. Annual meeting is taking place 03/09/24
 - ii. Asks for thoughts on not holding the work session and regular meeting in March, given there is good work done on 03/09
 - 1. 03/21 meeting may occur in Carver Rec
 - iii. Commissioners decide to cancel 03/07/24 work session and reserve the 03/21/24 regular meeting (will possibly be canceled)
 - iv. Next work session would be 04/04/24; would likely have to be in Carver Rec (will possibly be canceled)
 - v. Will decide at annual meeting which meetings will be held
- d. Discussion of Annual Planning Meeting
 - i. Review agenda for the meeting
 - ii. Facilitator is Rachael Randall, who is local and has expertise facilitating strategic planning meetings
 - iii. Will be getting to know each other, laying out focuses for the year, thinking about legislative recommendations, identifying potential panelists for panel discussions
 - iv. Commissioner asks about having primary and secondary focus areas
 - 1. The document included in the agenda packet is a starting point, so the Commission can decide what kind of/how many focuses they will have during the meeting
 - v. Commissioner confirms they will receive relevant materials before the meeting
 - vi. Commissioner confirms this meeting will be recorded like normal meetings; asks whether it is possible to move around the room setup to allow for talking to each other for lengths of time
 - 1. Commissioner says she has heard that meeting broadcasts from this room have been mostly unintelligible

2. Communications team member says this problem should be resolved now
 3. **Chair will look into room setup**
 4. Commissioner suggests having simply an audio recording
 5. Commissioner says retreats have been left not recorded in the past, so there may not be a legal requirement—recording is mostly for public accessibility
 - a. Director adds that the recording helps with taking minutes, which are required (minutes can capture
 - b. Use instead use a digital recording to capture audio for minutes
 6. Commissioner asks about time for talking about Commission's annual research project being added to the schedule—a requirement presented in the Ordinance
 - a. Commissioner says the definition of “research” can be rather broad, which allows the Commission to do its research duty
 - b. Director adds that research could be contacting housing groups and inviting panelists to create some kind of report or project to Council; ultimately, the Commission is doing work in the community while communicating with Council
- e. New business
- i. Commissioner says it has been reported that the City has purchased a lot at Levy Ave. and Avon St.; there have been talks on whether it will be turned into a homeless shelter
 1. Could be useful for the HRC to voice support for construction of a homeless shelter
 2. Another Commissioner adds that the Commission has talked about before the lack of year-round emergency shelter before, so the City filling this gap would allow for more equity
 3. It is an accessible location
 4. **Chair will talk to Vice Chair and Director about potential draft letter of support**
 - ii. Commissioner asks what the status is on the situation following up with leaders from the Salvation Army
 1. The Salvation Army wanted to expand their shelter, and the Commission had questions for them regarding LGBTQ+ inclusion and language accessibility
 - a. Commission had been divided on supporting the project without more transparency on their policies; the HRC ultimately voiced their support for the expansion to Council with the request that the Salvation Army provides proof of their compliance with human rights law
 - b. The Salvation Army has since received the go-ahead from City Council
 2. Vice Chair says the Commission had received a follow-up from Capt. Mark Van Meter in August 2023 addressing Salvation

Army policies regarding HUD accessibility, LGBTQ+ identity, and Safe Space training they provide for service providers

- a. Will forward this letter back out, and if the Commission thinks the response is not sufficient, the HRC can take further action

5. MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC

- a. PUBLIC COMMENT
 - i. None
- b. COMMISSION RESPONSE TO MATTERS BY THE PUBLIC
 - i. None

6. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

- a. Kathryn
 - i. There is a Livable Cville webinar on inclusive transportation—speaker is Veronica Davis, and there is someone from the City attending who can speak on City policies
 1. Occurring at 7pm on Wednesday, March 13; will send link
- b. Lily
 - i. Doing presentation the next day, 2/16, at SARA about the OHR/the Commission and its services
 - ii. Yesterday, 2/14, she did Wellness Bag deliveries at Westhaven through the Community-Based Recovery Support Network; primary purpose is information about different resources for support, as well as some personal hygiene products
 - iii. Survey has been posted on City social media pages, as well as a press release; is also being distributed through usual community outreach networks

7. NEXT STEPS

- a. Ernest (& Wolfgang)
 - i. Draft Levy/Avon homeless shelter support letter before annual meeting
 - ii. Look into room setup for annual meeting
- b. Entire Commission
 - i. Complete human rights survey and send it out to networks
 - ii. Do one-on-ones with Lily
- c. Andy & Jeanette
 - i. Exit interview with Lily and Todd

8. ADJOURN

- a. Meeting adjourned at 7:30 pm

Attachment 5



**Human Rights Commission
Meeting Minutes
Annual Meeting
March 9, 2024
Virtual/Electronic Meeting
9:30 am**

Click [HERE](#) to access the public link to the Human Rights Commission shared OneDrive folder.

Click [HERE](#) to access rebroadcasts of past Human Rights Commission meetings on YouTube.

Click [HERE](#) to access an archive of past Human Rights Commission work on the City website.

1. MORNING SESSION

- a. Welcome
 - i. CALL TO ORDER
 - 1. Chair, Ernest Chambers, called the meeting to order at 9:57 am
 - ii. ROLL CALL
 - 1. Ernest Chambers
 - 2. Wolfgang Keppley
 - 3. Mary Bauer
 - 4. Heather Gaston (virtual)
 - 5. Patti Hartigan
 - 6. Suzanne Lynn
 - iii. MISSION (recited by all): *Act as a strong advocate to justice and equal opportunity by providing citywide leadership and guidance in the area of civil rights.*
 - iv. Chair conducts icebreaker activities
- b. Commission takes a five-minute break
- c. OHR Director explains the history of the Charlottesville HRC
 - i. A version of Charlene Green's "Racial and Ethnic History of Charlottesville" presentation is available on YouTube
 - 1. Charlene was present for the creation of the OHR and HRC; she was the leader for the Dialogue on Race
 - ii. The OHR and HRC were created in a new Ordinance by a task force in 2013 as an initiative of the Dialogue on Race
 - iii. Recent evolution in the Office has been to hire more staff to mirror the structure of Offices/Commissions with enforcement power in Northern Virginia
 - iv. Office is currently in the process of pursuing a workshare agreement with HUD
 - v. Commission membership and focuses have increased and decreased throughout the years; its current structure is nine members with a more specific focus
 - vi. Commissioner asks whether Director has recommendations for specific actions the Commission should take

1. Director says it can be more effective when the Commission focuses on a single salient issue, and they can be more impactful when everyone is attending meetings and making the most of their limited time convening
 - vii. Vice Chair adds that it is important to stay informed as possible about relevant community issues while on the Commission
 - viii. HRC Resolutions are available on the website
 - ix. Chair acknowledges that finding traction doing the systemic human rights work can be difficult, and the community may have high expectations, but the work is still essential
 - d. Commissioners review sections of the Annual Report, including previous Commission actions and the OHR's HUD workshare pursuit
 - i. In the most recent set of Ordinance amendments, the OHR has been working on comments that HUD gave last time it was presented with the Ordinance, as well as other necessary fixes
- 2. Commission breaks for lunch from 12:00pm to 12:54pm**
- 3. AFTERNOON SESSION**
 - a. Outreach Specialist reviews Public Poll results
 - i. 213 responses
 - ii. Housing was the biggest concern amongst respondents
 - iii. It seems that respondents were often thinking about issues holistically and intersectionally
 - iv. Commissioner asks how the focus results compared to last year's poll
 1. There are more responses this year about re-entry
 - b. Vice Chair discusses topic model that they created of the comments
 - i. The most frequently discussed topic is housing, affordable housing, and people with disabilities
 - ii. Other highly mentioned topics include wraparound care for those experiencing homelessness and re-entry
 1. Wraparound care refers to everything from knowing how to access benefits to receiving undersupplied services like mental health support
 2. Commission could learn more about this by hosting another panel
 - iii. Another concern was about the City of Charlottesville respecting people from different backgrounds
 1. Ex. City holiday days off
 2. Director explains that inequities can arise when employees who celebrate Christmas automatically have it as a holiday, while employees of another religion may have to take work leave
 3. The Commission could take action about this in the form of a recommendation to Council
 4. Commissioner adds that some localities give observers of Ramadan off for Eid, as well as shorten their work day for two hours during Ramadan
 - iv. Two concerns were about City employee turnover or wages
 1. Director explains that the City is currently reassessing its pay rates; it has restructured its pay system across departments to implement out as soon as the new budget comes into effect

2. However, it is impacted by the three current collective bargaining contracts because the City needs to ensure non-unionized employees receive the same benefits as the unionized employees
 3. Could invite Human Resources to come explain the Comp and Class Evaluation and unions to talk about their work to see if there is a part of their work that could be improved based on equity and, as a result, affect City employee retention
 4. The lowest mentioned topic was advocating for more policing in the city for a rise in homelessness, drugs, and crime
- c. Commissioners discuss survey topics:
- i. Housing development
 1. Some Commissioners express that sometimes cutting down trees is necessary if it means more housing will be construction
 - a. Outreach Specialist says that the lack of trees and tree cover in Westhaven and other low-income communities is an issue that has come up from different groups; there have been studies linking the lack of tree cover, higher temperatures, and increase in higher crime
 - i. Commissioner says there is an equity issue that those renting do not invest as often in the land
 - b. If the Commission were to collaborate with other bodies about trees in Charlottesville, there is a volunteer Tree Commission, an Office of Sustainability, and non-profits like C3
 - ii. Commissioner asks about the status of substance use disorder treatment in the City
 - iii. Another Commissioner brings up supporting the City's construction of a new homeless shelter
 - iv. Also brings up movie about Vinegar Hill and paying reparations as a City
 1. Director says there were once plans to construct a large exhibit to recognize Vinegar Hill on the Downtown Mall, but the plans were dropped
 2. Another Commissioner adds that the descendants of people who were displaced and denied generational wealth are still in the area
 - v. Director advises Commission to pick one overall topic to focus on, but can also have one or two other smaller-scale projects to take action on more immediately
 1. Vice Chair takes notes on discussion
 2. Director will facilitate filling out work plan document
 - vi. Commissioner brings up the general hostility toward unhoused people in this area
 1. Director says the Commission could take on its guidance and awareness role by acting as a messenger for some kind of public announcement
 2. The presence of unhoused individuals on the Downtown Mall was a large conversation for the Downtown Mall Committee

3. Commissioner notes an increase in unhoused person encampments
- vii. Commissioner talks about re-entry
 1. Another Commissioner says that many comments seem to refer to the one-stop event that the Outreach Specialist attends
 - a. Different organizations who can help individuals who have recently been incarcerated table at Carver Rec
 - b. Finding housing is one of the biggest issues people who are re-entering are experiencing
- viii. Commissioner says that the shift from individual renters to property management companies has made it more difficult for those with a criminal record to secure housing
 1. Director adds that this is a good local issue to address that combines a protected activity (housing) with a protected class (race; criminal background)
 2. Commission has talked about housing testing before, but has not done it yet
 - a. Would have to be a collaborative project
- ix. Commissioner asks about private equity firms which take advantage of tenants by often requiring exorbitant application fees
 1. Asks if it is possible for firms to be required to register their units and costs with the City to ensure they are not charging potential tenants different rates
 2. Commission already has contacts of people and organizations who are already working on this kind of project
 3. Another Commission asks about how rezoning is increasing the inventory of affordable units and how the City is holding developers and property owners accountable
 - a. Also, who is defining affordability?
 4. Director says he has advocated for a rental registry and rental inspections, and other localities (such as in Wisconsin and New York) already do this
 - a. Advocating for this cause would likely take the form of state-level legislation support which would allow or require localities to create a registry
 - b. After getting state legislation, the next step would be to advocate for City Council to create this registry and hire the staff required to maintain it
 - c. Without the state's specific allowance for registries, there would not be anything to require landlords to participate
 - d. Commissioners and Director discuss how the housing market is so strongly controlled by demand that landlords do not really have an incentive to advertise their housing any more than they already do
- x. Director is currently working with the OHR Investigator to research how HUD sets payment standard for housing vouchers
 1. Because of the market, HUD's payment standards are constantly lagging behind current rent prices

2. It could be source of funds discrimination to have rent higher than HUD-established payment standards because landlords are systemically excluding every voucher holder
 - a. Vouchers currently cannot cover a rent price over a certain amount (ex. A \$1,000 voucher will not partially cover a \$1,200 rent price)
3. Currently researching current market-rate units with HUD payment standards
4. The Ordinance has a Director-initiated complaint mechanism for housing (upon a vote by the Commission)
5. Could also be systemic discrimination on the basis of source of funds when a landlord maintains a unit in such disrepair that it cannot pass a voucher inspection
6. If there is a finding of reasonable cause for housing discrimination to have occurred, Charlottesville's Ordinance requires an immediate filing of a civil suit
 - a. Commissioner believes this has likely already been tested in state courts
- xi. Commissioner says that many developers in Charlottesville are not affordable housing-friendly
 1. Could look into which developers are creating affordable properties
 2. Director points out there difference between developer and owner
 3. Commissioners discuss how when properties change hands, new managers may make the property no longer affordable for a fee that goes to the City's affordable housing fund
 4. Evictions in Virginia are also easier than other states
- xii. Commissioner points out trend of those facing homelessness tending to be older, such was the case for residents of Premier Circle in Charlottesville
 1. Midway Manor and Crescent Hall have remained sole sources of subsidized housing for older adults and those with disabilities
 2. Midway Manor is owned by a private provider, Crescent Hall is administered by CRHA, Woods Edge (located in the county) is owned by PHA; additional subsidized housing for these populations is limited
 3. PHA has tier-based model for subsidies
- xiii. Commissioner asks about supporting the ADA Transition Plan, which is due to come out before the end of the year
- xiv. Commissioner asks about the status of the Dialogue on Race in the city
 1. Director says they are currently in talks with the Deputy City Manager for Social Equity about internal equity amongst City employees
 - a. There have been multiple sessions of the Groundwater training
 - b. Have not yet talked about using the Office of Social Equity to engage the wider public
 - c. Has collaborated with the Albemarle Office of Equity

- and Inclusion on community events like the MLK Day walk
- d. Outreach Specialist is collaborating with Office of Sustainability to distribute copies of and have discussions about *All We Can Save* book, which applies equity approach
- 2. Commission could make recommendations to Council or separately collaborate with OHR Outreach Specialist on the Dialogue on Race
- xv. Commissioner talks about how to get higher public engagement for Commission talks and presentations
 - 1. Another Commissioner asks about holding events in a space where people have already often gathered already, such as a church
 - a. The City Manager must approve locations, and locations must have some kind of safety plan in place
 - b. **Director can ask City Managers about other spaces**
- xvi. Commissioner talks about the OHR offering Safe Space training to the public as a long-term goal
 - 1. OHR staff would have to be trained to offer the training, which could be a possibility given the skill set of the Office and Commission
 - 2. OHR also has copies of Charlene's slides from when she did Safe Space training
 - 3. Director says they could develop curriculum as an OHR side project to present to the Commission
- xvii. Director says it may be helpful for Commissioners to engage with initiatives the City Manager is planning those rather than begin completely separate projects
- xviii. Commissioners continue reading over survey responses:
 - 1. A large-scale study would require significant bandwidth and expert consultation
 - 2. Commissioner talks about the HRC speaking up about how the voting system disenfranchises Black people—could be a legislative recommendation
 - 3. Commissioner asks about grocery store location in the context of food insecurity
 - a. Director says Commission could call upon members of the Charlottesville food justice network to get more information if they are looking to make a legislative recommendation
- d. Commission takes an eight-minute break
- e. HRC Work Plan creation
 - i. Commissioners use notes, previous discussion, and work plan template to decide on primary and secondary focus areas for the year
 - ii. Discuss how points from the survey responses may be converted to actionable items
 - 1. Official focus areas are in the work plan document
 - iii. Primary focus is housing, and sub-topics are homelessness and

systemic barriers

- iv. Secondary focus areas will be legislative recommendations, including removing voter exclusion from the state constitution and addressing rental application fees, Safe Space training program development, and exploring reparations
- v. Commissioners look at potential action items in relation to calendar outline
 - 1. Public hearing training would likely be asking Chairs and Directors from larger Commissions in Northern Virginia to conduct it--Commissioners express interest in having public hearing training
 - 2. Commission is interested in holding expert panels more than town halls
 - 3. Commissioners and Director continue refining dates and action items listed in the calendar based on this year's focus areas
- f. Commission decides to hold a work session meeting on 4/4/24 to continue creating Work Plan

4. NEXT STEPS

- a. Work Session 4/4/24
- b. Todd
 - i. Ask City Managers about potential alternative meeting locations that would attract more members of the public

5. ADJOURN

- a. Meeting adjourned at 4:00 pm

Attachment 6

Office of Human Rights
OHR Monthly Report
April 2024

Administrative Updates:

- Fair Housing Assistance Program (FHAP) workshare agreement
 - Staff have prepared a rough draft of an amended Human Rights Ordinance based on the feedback provided by HUD.
 - Staff met with representatives from HUD and the City Attorney's Office to review the proposed amendments and gather feedback.
 - Staff will incorporate the amendments suggested by HUD, review with the City Attorney's Office, and schedule a follow up with HUD.
- Fair Employment Practices Agency (FEPA) workshare agreement
 - On hold until the FHAP certification is complete.
 - The FHAP agreement provides substantial opportunities and resources to expand and improve the OHR, whereas the FEPA increases workload with insufficient support to increase staffing or training.

Outreach Updates:

- One on one outreach meetings are ongoing! If any of the remaining Commissioners who have not yet participated would like to schedule a meeting with Lily, please email her. Staff would love to talk with commissioners before outreach season picks up for the Spring and Summer.
- The OHR has been collaborating with other City offices, Albemarle County offices, and community organizations such as the Cville National Organization for Women to host a Community Read and panel discussion of *All We Can Save* in celebration of Women's History Month and Earth Month. Copies of the book are available to the public for free at any JMRL location and some Little Free Libraries in the City and County. The panel discussion and resource fair will be held on 4/21 from 1pm—3pm at the JMRL Central library.
- The OHR is hosting a hybrid Fair Housing Know Your Rights Presentation and Q&A on April 25th at 6pm in CitySpace and on Zoom. We will be presenting in conjunction with local housing experts and lawyers. Commissioners are welcome to attend!
- The OHR is in the early stages of beginning to plan education and awareness events for May. If any commissioners would like to collaborate on planning, please let Lily know.

Planned Outreach Events: Please let Lily know if you would like to participate in any of these events.

Day	Date	Time	Event	Location	Organizer
Friday	4/19/24	10-11:30am	Conversations During Conflict Panel	CitySpace	OHR and partners
Sunday	4/21/24	1pm—3pm	Community Read Panel Discussion and Resource Fair	JMRL Central Swanson Room	OHR and partners
Wednesday	4/24/24	9am—12pm	Groundwater Training	Zoom	Racial Equity Institute and City
Wednesday	4/24/24	7pm	Housing First: Homelessness & Program Access	The Haven	The Haven
Thursday	4/25/24	6pm	Fair Housing Presentation and Q&A	CitySpace/Zoom	OHR and partners

Service Provision Data:

- Current status
 - Complete data entered through March 2024.
 - Partial data entered for April.
- Updates
 - Values may change in subsequent reports if an error is caught and corrected.

[illegible]

[illegible]

Measures	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	TOTALS
Housing inquiries in Albemarle Co.	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
Housing inquiries in other and unspecified localities	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Public Accommodation Inquiries & Complaints	6	2	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	11
Public accommodation inquiries & complaints in Charlottesville	5	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
Public accommodation inquiries in Albemarle Co.	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Public accommodation inquiries in other and unspecified localities	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total Credit Inquiries & Complaints	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Credit inquiries & complaints in Charlottesville	5	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
Credit inquiries in Albemarle Co.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Credit inquiries in other and unspecified localities	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Private Education Inquiries & Complaints	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Private education inquiries & complaints in Charlottesville	5	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
Private education inquiries in Albemarle Co.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Private education inquiries in other and unspecified localities	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Other (Unprotected) Inquiries & Complaints	5	10	8	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	26
Other (Unprotected) inquiries & complaints in Charlottesville	1	2	4	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
Other (Unprotected) inquiries in Albemarle Co.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other (Unprotected) inquiries in other and unspecified localities	4	8	4	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	18
Total I&C: P.C. - Age	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total I&C: P.C. - Elderliness (Housing)	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total I&C: P.C. - Disability	6	1	3	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	11
Total I&C: P.C. - Marital Status	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - National Origin	4	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6
Total I&C: P.C. - Pregnancy	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Childbirth or Related Medical Conditions	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Familial Status (Housing)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Race	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
Total I&C: P.C. - Color	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total I&C: P.C. - Religion	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Sex	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Gender Identity	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total I&C: P.C. - Sexual Orientation	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total I&C: P.C. - Source of Funds (Housing)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total I&C: P.C. - Veteran Status	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total I&C: P.C. - Not specified	10	9	12	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	34
Total I&C: P.C. - Other (Unprotected)	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total Contacts resulting in Referrals	4	1	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9
Referrals to AG OCR	3	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7
Referrals to AIM	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to APS	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Referrals to CPD	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to CPS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to CRHA	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to CRL	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to CVLAS	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Referrals to DARS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to DBHDS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to DHS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Referrals to DJC	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

[illegible]

Measures	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	TOTALS
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Disability	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Marital Status	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - National Origin	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Pregnancy	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Childbirth or R.M.C.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Race	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Color	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Religion	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Sex	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Gender Identity	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Sexual Orientation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Source of Funds	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Veteran Status	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Not specified	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Housing Complaints: P.C. - Other (Unprotected)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Age	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Disability	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Marital Status	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - National Origin	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Pregnancy	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Childbirth or R.M.C.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Race	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Color	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Religion	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Sex	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Gender Identity	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Sexual Orientation	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Veteran Status	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Not specified	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Pub. Accom. Comp.: P.C. - Other (Unprotected)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Open Inquiries	10	6	6	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	27
Total Closed Inquiries	11	8	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	29
Total Open Complaints	3	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
Total Closed Complaints	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Conciliation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Court Action	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Informal Resolution	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: No Response	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Non-jurisdictional	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Private Counsel	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Referred Case	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Settlement	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Complaint Closure: Withdrawal	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Inquiry Closure: Informal Resolution	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Inquiry Closure: Navigation Only	11	6	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	26
Reason for Inquiry Closure: No Response	0	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
Reason for Inquiry Closure: Referral	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Reason for Inquiry Closure: Complaint Filed	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Primary Service: Case Administration	5	10	13	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	37

Measures	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	TOTALS
Primary Service: Conciliation Activity	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Primary Service: Informal Dialogue	0	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	13
Primary Service: Information	43	14	8	11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	76
Primary Service: Intake Activity	85	131	30	42	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	288
Primary Service: Investigation Activity	2	5	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8
Primary Service: Mediation Activity	1	0	16	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	23
Primary Service: Navigation & Advocacy	31	18	19	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	76

Reporting:

Report	Status
CY2023 HRC & OHR Annual Report	Completed. Posted on Human Rights webpage. To be presented to Council on June 3, 2024.
CY2024 First Quarter Report to Council	Completed and submitted to Council on April 17, 2024.
CY2024 Second Quarter Report to Council	To be submitted to Council in July 2024.
CY2024 Third Quarter Report to Council	To be submitted to Council in October 2024.

Active Complaints:

Case #	Protected Activity	Protected Class(es)	Status
2020-2	Housing	Race	Investigation completed and determination in progress.
2021-4	Employment	Sex	Investigation in progress.
2021-5	Employment	Sexual Orientation, Race	Investigation in progress.
2022-6	Housing	Color, Race	Mediation at impasse, next steps under consideration.
2023-2	Employment	Religion, National Origin	Pending closure due to non-response from Complainant.
2023-7	Public Accommodation	Sex	Investigation in progress.
2024-1	Housing	Race	Dismissed as not presenting a prima facie case
2024-2	Housing	Age, Disability	Mediation in progress.
2024-3	Public Accommodation	National Origin, Sexual Orientation	Mediation in progress.
2024-4	Housing	Disability	Complaint under assessment for further action.

Outreach Data Summary: Some more recent events may be pending entry.

Measures	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	TOTALS
<i>Open office days in the month</i>	22	20	20	22	22	19	22	22	20	23	18	20	250
<i>Total service provision events</i>	3	6	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	13
<i>Total education & awareness events</i>	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
<i>Total collaboration & leadership events</i>	12	12	16	11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	51
<i>Total outreach activities</i>	17	19	18	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	67
<i>Total unique primary collaborators</i>	<i>No monthly count only total count</i>												30
<i>Total collaborative activities</i>	16	17	17	13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	63
<i>Total attendees at service provision events</i>	79	146	5	45	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	275
<i>Total attendees at education & awareness events</i>	104	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	104
<i>Total newsletter opens</i>	357	380	369	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1106

HRC Work Summary:

Date	Roles (Sec. 433)	Duties & Responsibilities	HRC Annual Focus	Primary Action	Summary & Analysis
1/5/2024	Sec. 2-433. (e) Legislative Program	Sec. 2-435 Systemic issues	N/A	Public Discussion	The Commission invited Delegate Callsen, City Councilor Snook, and the City Attorney to share updates regarding Council's legislative priorities and the process for bill sponsorship for the recommendations presented by the Commission.
1/18/2024	Sec. 2-433. (b) Awareness and Guidance	Sec. 2-434 Community dialogue and engagement.	N/A	Public Discussion	The Commission partnered with the City ADA Coordinator and Precision Infrastructure Management for a public presentation about updates to the City's ADA Transition Plan.